

United States District Court
Northern District of Illinois – CM/ECF LIVE, Ver 6.2.2 (Chicago)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:18-cv-02120

Comforte et al v. Cambridge Analytica et al
Assigned to: Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo
Cause: 28:1331 Federal Question

Date Filed: 03/22/2018
Date Terminated: 06/06/2018
Jury Demand: Plaintiff
Nature of Suit: 890 Other Statutory Actions
Jurisdiction: Federal Question

Plaintiff

Victor James Comforte, II

*individually, and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Joseph Scott Davidson**

Sulaiman Law Group, Ltd.
2500 S. Highland Avenue
Suite 200
Lombard, IL 60148
(630) 575-8181 x116
Email: jdavidson@sulaimanlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James C. Vlahakis

Sulaiman Law Group, Ltd.
2500 S. Highland Avenue
Suite 200
Lombard, IL 60148
(630) 575-8181
Email: jvlahakis@sulaimanlaw.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Plaintiff

Brendan Michael Carr

*individually, and on behalf of all others
similarly situated*

represented by **Joseph Scott Davidson**

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

James C. Vlahakis

(See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

V.

Defendant

Cambridge Analytica

represented by **Cambridge Analytica**

597 Fifth Avenue – 7th Floor
New York, NY 10017
646-891-4021
PRO SE

Mark C. Scarsi

Milbank Tweed Hadley & McCloy LLP
2029 Century Park East

33rd Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90067
424 386 4580
TERMINATED: 05/10/2018

Nancy Anne Temple
Katten & Temple, LLP
209 S. LaSalle Street
Suite 950
Chicago, IL 60604
(312) 663-0800
Email: ntemple@kattentemple.com
TERMINATED: 05/10/2018

Richard Bradshaw Kapnick
Katten & Temple LLP
209 S. LaSalle Street, Suite 950
Chicago, IL 60604
United Sta
(312) 663-4463
Email: rkapnick@kattentemple.com
TERMINATED: 05/10/2018

Defendant

Facebook, Inc.

represented by **Orin Samuel Snyder**
Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP
200 Park Avenue
New York, NY 10166
(212) 351-2400
Email: osnyder@gibsondunn.com
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joshua S. Lipshutz
Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP
1050 Connecticut Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20036
(202) 955-8217
Email: jlipshutz@gibsondunn.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristin Andrea Linsley
Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher LLP
Suite 3000
555 Mission Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
(415) 393-8395
Email: KLinsley@gibsondunn.com
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nathan P. Eimer
Eimer Stahl LLP

224 South Michigan Avenue
 Suite 1100
 Chicago, IL 60604
 (312) 660-7600
 Email: neimer@eimerstahl.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan M. Razzano
 Eimer Stahl LLP
 224 South Michigan Avenue
 Suite 1100
 Chicago, IL 60604-2516
 312 660-7600
 Email: srazzano@eimerstahl.com
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

Mark Zuckerberg

represented by **Orin Samuel Snyder**
 (See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Joshua S. Lipshutz
 (See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Kristin Andrea Linsley
 (See above for address)
PRO HAC VICE
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Nathan P. Eimer
 (See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Susan M. Razzano
 (See above for address)
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

John and Jane Does 1-100

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
03/22/2018	I 1	COMPLAINT <i>Class Action</i> filed by Victor James Comforte, II, Brendan Michael Carr; Jury Demand. Filing fee \$ 400, receipt number 0752-14269895. (Attachments: # 1 Civil Cover Sheet)(Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/22/2018	I 2	ATTORNEY Appearance for Plaintiffs Brendan Michael Carr, Victor James Comforte, II by James C. Vlahakis (Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/22/2018	I 3	

		ATTORNEY Appearance for Plaintiffs Brendan Michael Carr, Victor James Comforte, II by Joseph Scott Davidson (Davidson, Joseph) (Entered: 03/22/2018)
03/23/2018	I 1	CASE ASSIGNED to the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo. Designated as Magistrate Judge the Honorable Jeffrey Cole. (yt) (Entered: 03/23/2018)
03/23/2018	I 4	NOTICE TO THE PARTIES – The Court is participating in the Mandatory Initial Discovery Pilot (MIDP). The key features and deadlines are set forth in this Notice which includes a link to the (MIDP) Standing Order and a Checklist for use by the parties. In cases subject to the pilot, all parties must respond to the mandatory initial discovery requests set forth in the Standing Order before initiating any further discovery in this case. Please note: The discovery obligations in the Standing Order supersede the disclosures required by Rule 26(a)(1). Any party seeking affirmative relief must serve a copy of the following documents (Notice of Mandatory Initial Discovery and the Standing Order) on each new party when the Complaint, Counterclaim, Crossclaim, or Third-Party Complaint is served. (aee,) (Entered: 03/23/2018)
03/30/2018	I 5	SUMMONS Issued as to Defendants Cambridge Analytica, Facebook, Inc., Mark Zuckerberg (pg,) (Entered: 03/30/2018)
04/03/2018	I 5	MOTION for Transfer of Actions to the Northern District of California and for Consolidation Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407 (Exhibits). (Attachments: # 1 Memorandum, # 2 Schedule of Actions, # 3 Proof of Service) (Document does not contain case number) (aee,) (Entered: 04/04/2018)
04/05/2018	I 6	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Facebook, Inc. by Nathan P. Eimer (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 7	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Facebook, Inc. by Susan M. Razzano (Razzano, Susan) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 8	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Mark Zuckerberg by Nathan P. Eimer (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 9	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Mark Zuckerberg by Susan M. Razzano (Razzano, Susan) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 10	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0752-14317939. (Snyder, Orin) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 11	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0752-14318095. (Lipshutz, Joshua) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/05/2018	I 12	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0752-14318121. (Linsley, Kristin) (Entered: 04/05/2018)
04/06/2018	I 13	MOTION by Defendants Facebook, Inc., Mark Zuckerberg for extension of time to file answer (<i>Joint Motion</i>) (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 04/06/2018)
04/06/2018	I 14	NOTICE of Motion by Nathan P. Eimer for presentment of motion for extension of time to file answer <u>13</u> before Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo on 4/16/2018 at 09:30 AM. (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 04/06/2018)
04/10/2018	I 15	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo: Application to appear pro hac vice of Orin Snyder <u>10</u> , Joshua Lipshutz <u>11</u> and Kristin Linsley <u>12</u> as counsel for Defendants Facebook, Inc. and Mark Zuckerberg are granted. Mailed notice. (mgh,) (Entered: 04/10/2018)
04/10/2018	I 16	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendants Facebook, Inc., Mark Zuckerberg by Orin Samuel Snyder (Snyder, Orin) (Entered: 04/10/2018)

04/10/2018	<u>i</u> <u>17</u>	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendants Facebook, Inc., Mark Zuckerberg by Joshua S. Lipshutz (Lipshutz, Joshua) (Entered: 04/10/2018)
04/10/2018	<u>i</u> <u>18</u>	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendants Facebook, Inc., Mark Zuckerberg by Kristin Andrea Linsley (Linsley, Kristin) (Entered: 04/10/2018)
04/10/2018	<u>i</u> <u>20</u>	NOTICE of Appearance. (aee,) Modified on 4/12/2018 (aee,). (Entered: 04/12/2018)
04/10/2018	<u>i</u> <u>21</u>	NOTICE of Related Actions (Exhibits). (aee,) (Entered: 04/12/2018)
04/11/2018	<u>i</u> <u>22</u>	RESPONSE by Defendant Facebook, Inc. in support of plaintiff's motion <u>5</u> to transfer to related cases for consolidated pretrial proceedings (Exhibits). (aee,) (Entered: 04/12/2018)
04/12/2018	<u>i</u> <u>19</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo: Joint motion for extension of time to answer until after ruling by MDL Panel <u>13</u> is granted. Status hearing set for 5/17/2018 at 09:30 AM. Mailed notice <attachments> (reg) (Entered: 04/12/2018)
04/13/2018	<u>i</u> <u>23</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Victor James Comforde, II, Brendan Michael Carr as to Cambridge Analytica on 4/5/2018, answer due 4/26/2018. (Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 04/13/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>24</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2 by Facebook, Inc. (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 04/19/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>25</u>	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Cambridge Analytica by Richard Bradshaw Kapnick (Kapnick, Richard) (Entered: 04/19/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>26</u>	ATTORNEY Appearance for Defendant Cambridge Analytica by Nancy Anne Temple (Temple, Nancy) (Entered: 04/19/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>27</u>	NOTICE of Appearance. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>28</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>29</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service)(aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>30</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>31</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>32</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service)(aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>33</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>34</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/19/2018	<u>i</u> <u>35</u>	NOTIFICATION of Affiliates pursuant to Local Rule 3.2. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 04/23/2018)
04/24/2018	<u>i</u> <u>36</u>	MOTION by Defendant Cambridge Analytica for extension of time AGREED MOTION FOR EXTENSION OF TIME TO ANSWER OR OTHERWISE RESPOND TO PLAINTIFFS COMPLAINT (Kapnick, Richard) (Entered: 04/24/2018)

04/24/2018	<u>i</u> <u>37</u>	NOTICE of Motion by Richard Bradshaw Kapnick for presentment of extension of time <u>36</u> before Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo on 5/11/2018 at 09:30 AM. (Kapnick, Richard) (Entered: 04/24/2018)
04/24/2018	<u>i</u> <u>38</u>	MOTION for Leave to Appear Pro Hac Vice Filing fee \$ 150, receipt number 0752-14391523. (Mark, Scarsi) (Entered: 04/24/2018)
04/25/2018	<u>i</u> <u>39</u>	RESPONSE by CA and SCL in support of plaintiffs' motion to transfer related cases for consolidated pretrial proceedings. (aee,) (Entered: 04/26/2018)
04/25/2018	<u>i</u> <u>40</u>	AMENDED NOTICE of Appearance. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Proof of Service) (aee,) (Entered: 05/01/2018)
04/30/2018	<u>i</u> <u>41</u>	RESPONSE by Christina Labajo's in support of motion to transfer actions to the Northern District of California and for consolidation Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407. (aee,) (Entered: 05/01/2018)
05/02/2018	<u>i</u> <u>42</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo: Defendants' agreed motion for extension of time to answer or otherwise respond to plaintiffs' complaint <u>36</u> is granted to (30) days after the JPML issues a decision on the pending motion for transfer and consolidation. Application to appear pro hac vice of Mark C. Scarsi <u>38</u> is granted. Status hearing previously set for 5/17/2018 is reset for 7/13/2018 at 9:30 a.m. Mailed notice. (mgh,) (Entered: 05/02/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>43</u>	MOTION by Plaintiffs Brendan Michael Carr, Victor James Comforte, IIfor the entry of a Document and Data Preservation Order against Defendant Cambridge Analytic, LLC <i>Filed as an Emergency Motion</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Ex. A Notice of Withdrawal of Mark C. Scarsi, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Ex. B Proposed Document and Data Preservation Order)(Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>44</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Jeffrey Cole: Late last evening on 5/2/2018 at 5:18pm, James Vlahakis called left two voice mail messages. I returned his call from my car that evening and was told by Mr. Vlahakis that he had an emergency matter that had to be heard the next morning. He did not say what the matter was and I did not ask. I told him he could appear at 8:15 a.m. today and to inform the other side. Mr. Vlahakis never appeared. I learned this morning that Mr. Vlahakis had sent an after hours email to my courtroom deputy telling her that there was an emergency -- which he did not describe -- and that he realized that the case was Judge Bucklo's and the emergency Judge was Judge Norgle. His situation could not wait until Judge Norgle heard his 10:00 motions and that I was the "assigned" magistrate judge and that the matter had to be heard first thing in the morning. His words were "time is critical in this case." Leaving aside the rather obvious fact that there had been no referral to me and thus I was powerless to hear anything he chose to bring to my attention regarding this case, Mr. Vlahakis was insistent on appearing here this morning. Yet, despite the apparent exigent nature of the matter, Mr. Vlahakis never bothered to call or say he would not appear. One more thing. At 6:30 a.m. my courtroom deputy arrived at work at her customary time and called Mr. Vlahakis back. He did not return the call. Judge's time matters. McQuiggin v. Perkins, 569 U.S. 383, 384 (2013); Airframe Systems, Inc. v. Raytheon Co., 601 F.3d 9, 14 (1st Cir. 2010); United States v. Alcan Aluminum, Inc., 25 F.3d 1174, 1183 (3rd Cir. 1994); Matter of Memorial Hosp. of Iowa County, Inc., 862 F.2d 1299, 1302 (7th Cir. 1988). Lawyers ought to have due regard for the scarcity of judicial resources and for the fact that ever hour needlessly spent on a case where relief cannot and ought not be granted is an hour taken away from litigants who genuinely need the court's time. Klein v. O'Brien, 884 F.3d 754, 757 (7th Cir. 2018)Mailed notice (jms,) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>45</u>	NOTICE of Motion by James C. Vlahakis for presentment of motion for miscellaneous relief, <u>43</u> before Honorable Charles R. Norgle Sr. on 5/4/2018 at 10:00 AM. (Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>46</u>	MOTION by Defendant Cambridge Analytica to withdraw <i>COUNSEL OF RECORDS MOTION FOR LEAVE TO WITHDRAW</i> (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Notification of Party Contact Information)(Kapnick, Richard) (Entered: 05/03/2018)

05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>47</u>	NOTICE of Motion by Richard Bradshaw Kapnick for presentment of motion to withdraw <u>46</u> before Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo on 5/11/2018 at 09:30 AM. (Kapnick, Richard) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>48</u>	NOTICE by Brendan Michael Carr, Victor James Comforte, II re text entry,,,,,, <u>44</u> Notice of Filing/Proof of Service of email (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit May 3, 2018, email from J. Vlahakis to the Honorable Judge J. Cole)(Vlahakis, James) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/03/2018	<u>i</u> <u>49</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Jeffrey Cole: Mr. Vlahakis has filed an email that he wrote to me explaining the mix up that had occurred this morning. <u>48</u> . That email was entirely unnecessary but nonetheless it was thoughtful of Mr. Vlahakis to have written it. Accordingly, my earlier order of 5/3/18 <u>44</u> is withdrawn.Mailed notice (jms,) (Entered: 05/03/2018)
05/04/2018	<u>i</u> <u>50</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Charles R. Norgle:Emergency Motion for Document and Data Preservation Order <u>43</u> is denied. Motion hearing held on 5/4/2018. (Emergency Judge) Mailed notice (ewf,) (Entered: 05/04/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>i</u> <u>51</u>	REPLY Memorandum in support of Plaintiffs' motion for transfer of actions to the Northern District of California and for consolidation pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407. (ew,) (Entered: 05/07/2018)
05/07/2018	<u>i</u> <u>53</u>	NOTICE of Presentation or waiver of oral argument by Plaintiff Debra Kooser and Margaret Frankiewicz. (kp,) (Entered: 05/15/2018)
05/10/2018	<u>i</u> <u>52</u>	MINUTE entry before the Honorable Elaine E. Bucklo: Counsel of record's motion for leave to withdraw <u>46</u> is granted. Counsel, Nancy Anne Temple, Richard Bradshaw Kapnick and Mark C. Scarsi ar terminated. No appearance required on 5/11/2018. Mailed notice. (mgh,) (Entered: 05/10/2018)
05/18/2018	<u>i</u> <u>54</u>	SUGGESTION of Bankruptcy as to Cambridge Analytica LLC (Eimer, Nathan) (Entered: 05/18/2018)
05/23/2018	<u>i</u> <u>55</u>	MEMORANDUM by Jonathan D. Rubin in support of plaintiff's motion for transfer of actions to the Northern District of California and for consolidation pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407. (aee,) (Entered: 05/25/2018)
06/06/2018	<u>i</u> <u>56</u>	CONDITIONAL TRANSFER ORDER from MDL Panel transferring case to the Northern District of California.(aee,) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/06/2018	<u>I</u>	***Civil Case Terminated pursuant to MDL 2843 Conditional Transfer Order filed 06/06/2018. (aee,) (Entered: 06/07/2018)
06/07/2018	<u>i</u> <u>57</u>	TRANSFERRED to the Northern District of California the electronic record. (aee,) (Entered: 06/07/2018)